

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE WESTERN DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA  
CHARLOTTE DIVISION  
Civil Action No.: 3:18-CV-00197

BRUCE RHYNE and JANICE RHYNE,	)	
	)	
Plaintiffs,	)	
	)	
vs.	)	
	)	
UNITED STATES STEEL CORPORATION,	)	
SUNOCO, INC. (R&M) f/k/a Sun Company, Inc.	)	
and f/k/a/ Sun Oil Company, Inc., EXXONMOBIL	)	
CORPORATION, CHEVRON U.S.A., Inc. as	)	
Successor in Interest to Gulf Oil Company,	)	
SAFETY-KLEEN SYSTEMS, INC., CRC	)	
INDUSTRIES, INC., UNIVAR USA, INC.	)	
f/k/a Chemcentral Corp. and Van Waters &	)	
Rodgers, Inc., KANO LABORATORIES, INC., THE	)	
STECO CORPORATION, ACUITY SPECIALTY	)	
PRODUCTS, INC. f/k/a Acuity Specialty Products	)	
Group, Inc., THE SAVOGRAN COMPANY, TURTLE	)	
WAX, INC., Individually and as Successor in Interest	)	
to Marvel Oil Company, Inc.,	)	
	)	
Defendants.	)	

**DEFENDANT TURTLE WAX, INC.’S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT**

Now Comes Defendant Turtle Wax, Inc., individually and incorrectly named as successor in interest to Marvel Oil Company, Inc. (hereinafter “Defendant” or “Turtle Wax”) by and through undersigned counsel and moves the Court, pursuant to Rule 56 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, for summary judgment as to all claims against them in this action.<sup>1</sup> The pleadings, discovery responses, depositions and other documents and evidence contained in the Record establish that there are no genuine issues of material fact

---

<sup>1</sup> Defendant Turtle Wax reserves its right to renew its Motion for Summary Judgment after the Court rules on Motions to Exclude Plaintiffs’ Experts, which per the scheduling order, are to be filed as Motions in Limine.

and that Defendant Turtle Wax is entitled to prevail as a matter of law in this action for the following reasons:

- Plaintiffs lack evidence to prove their claim for Negligence under North Carolina Product Liability Statute;
- Plaintiffs lack adequate evidence of a defect in any product sold by Defendant Turtle Wax or a breach of duty by Defendant Turtle Wax as there is not adequate evidence showing that Marvel Mystery Oil used by Mr. Rhyne contained benzene;
- Plaintiffs lack evidence of sufficient exposure to benzene from Marvel Mystery Oil to support their claims, and as such, Plaintiffs' claims should be dismissed;
- Plaintiffs' Design Defect Claims Fail For Lack Of A Feasible Alternative Design;
- Plaintiffs' Inadequate Warning Claims Fail For Lack Of Evidence;
- Defendant is also entitled to Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' Breach of Implied Warranty Claims because Plaintiffs have failed to present adequate evidence of a product defect;
- Defendant is also entitled to Summary Judgment on Plaintiffs' Fraudulent Concealment claims because Plaintiffs have failed to present adequate evidence of any fraud by Defendant;
- There is not sufficient evidence to support a claim for punitive damages or a claim for loss of consortium against Defendant.

Defendant Turtle Wax respectfully requests that their Motion for Summary Judgment be GRANTED.<sup>2</sup>

This the 27<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2019.

CRANFILL SUMNER & HARTZOG LLP

BY: /s/ John W. Ong  
John W. Ong, NC Bar #24674  
Virginia Wooten, NC Bar #48180  
*Attorneys for Defendant Turtle Wax*  
Post Office Box 30787  
Charlotte, North Carolina 28230  
Telephone: (704) 332-8300  
E-mail: jong@cshlaw.com  
vwooten@cshlaw.com

---

<sup>2</sup> Defendant Turtle Wax reserves its right to renew its Motion for Summary Judgment after the Court rules on Motions to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts, which per the scheduling order, are to be filed as Motions in Limine.

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 27<sup>th</sup> day of November, 2019, I electronically filed the foregoing **DEFENDANT TURTLE WAX, INC.'S MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT** with the clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following attorneys of record:

· **Brian Andrew Bender**

bbender@harrisbeach.com

· **Peri Berger**

pberger@harrisbeach.com, ManagingClerksNYC@HarrisBeach.com, HBSafetyKleen@HarrisBeach.com

· **Matthew Cairone**

mcc@caironelawfirm.com

· **Diana Coad**

diana.coad@rtt-law.com, Sheryl.Jones@rtt-law.com, erin.sweatman@rttlaw.com, robyn.thompson@rtt-law.com

· **Kathy K. Condo**

kcondo@babstcalland.com

· **Judi Abbott Curry**

jcurry@harrisbeach.com

· **Mark Philip Doby**

mdoby@wallacegraham.com

· **Andrew J. DuPont**

adupont@lockslaw.com, etelles@lockslaw.com, clippmann@lockslaw.com

· **Jennifer Lynne Emmons**

jemmons@lockslaw.com

· **Andrew P. Fishkin**

afishkin@fishkinlucks.com, lhoefel@fishkinlucks.com, akim@fishkinlucks.com, awyckoff@fishkinlucks.com

· **William M. Graham**

bgraham@wallacegraham.com, cpine@wallacegraham.com, athompson@wallacegraham.com, mdoby@wallacegraham.com

· **Timothy Gray**

Tim.Gray@formanwatkins.com

· **John T. Holden**

jholden@dmclaw.com,mpritt@dmclaw.com,mhopey@dmclaw.com

- **Janice Holmes**

jholmes@gwblawfirm.com,sbook@gwblawfirm.com

- **John S. Hughes**

jhughes@wallacegraham.com,lwike@wallacegraham.com,mwallace@wallacegraham.com

- **Howard E. Jarvis**

jarvish@wmbac.com,gsutton@wmbac.com,acarr@wmbac.com

- **John T. Jeffries**

jjeffries@mgclaw.com,patricia.powell@mgclaw.com,elifer@mgclaw.com

- **Christopher M. Kelly**

ckelly@gwblawfirm.com,clee@gwblawfirm.com

- **Douglas Everette Kingsbery**

dek@tharringtonsmith.com,bsvendsgaard@tharringtonsmith.com

- **Jeffrey Brandt Kuykendal**

jeffrey.kuykendal@mgclaw.com,patricia.powell@mgclaw.com,laura.martin@mgclaw.com

- **Christopher C. Lam**

clam@bradley.com,jschulz@bradley.com,chester@bradley.com,dholdren@bradley.com

- **Brian M. Ledger**

bledger@grsm.com

- **Steven M. Lucks**

slucks@fishkinlucks.com,kroman@fishkinlucks.com,awyckoff@fishkinlucks.com

- **Chad D. Mountain**

cmountain@maronmarvel.com,nhares@maronmarvel.com

- **Timothy Peck**

tpeck@foxrothschild.com,hhgrant@foxrothschild.com

- **Eric G. Sauls**

eric.sauls@lewisbrisbois.com

- **Vaughn Karl Schultz**

vschultz@dmclaw.com

- **Jonathan Edward Schulz**

jschulz@bradley.com,mduscha@bradley.com,chester@bradley.com

- **Thomas McRoy Shelley , III**

roy.shelley@rtt-law.com

· **Joshua S. Snyder**

jsnyder@babstcalland.com

· **William M. Starr**

bill.starr@nelsonmullins.com,kathy.southworth@nelsonmullins.com,jill.tucker@nelsonmullins.com

· **Christopher Stofko**

cstofko@dmclaw.com

· **Daniel Robert Strecker**

dstrecker@HarrisBeach.com

· **Michael Joseph Sweeney**

msweeney@dmclaw.com

· **Daniel Bowman White**

dwhite@gwblawfirm.com

· **Nicholas Damian Wilson**

nwilson@gordonrees.com

CRANFILL SUMNER & HARTZOG LLP

BY: /s/ John W. Ong

John W. Ong, NC Bar #24674

Virginia Wooten, NC Bar #48180

*Attorneys for Defendant Turtle Wax*

Post Office Box 30787

Charlotte, North Carolina 28230

Telephone: (704) 332-8300

E-mail: jong@cshlaw.com

vwooten@cshlaw.com